THE CURRENT SITUATION OF ENTREPRENEURSHIP EDUCATION IN TÜRKİYE AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

Dr. Bekir KUL
National Education Specialist, Ministry of National Education, bekirkul@hotmail.com; bekir.kul@meb.gov.tr
Ankara / Türkiye
ORCID: 0000-0001-6687-717X

ABSTRACT
The presence of an entrepreneurial person in a society is one of the most important production factors in the creation of socioeconomic value and social development. Entrepreneurship education, which aims to provide students with the skills necessary to be successful primarily in social life and then in business life, has also become an indispensable and powerful part of today's curriculum. The importance of entrepreneurship education will be better understood when Türkiye’s historical background, current situation, young and dynamic population, potential that is open and ready to develop, and its social needs are considered. Institutions and organizations that focus on these common concerns and the understanding that all students can become entrepreneurs in the future conduct various studies in the field of entrepreneurship skills and entrepreneurship education. In this study, entrepreneurship skills, which are considered as an integrated social sciences field skill, and entrepreneurship education are discussed within the scope of contemporary curricula. The current situation analysis on the subject is made, and suggestions for improvement are presented for decision-makers and practitioners based on the data obtained. According to the results of this research in which the studies on entrepreneurship education were examined through open sources; many institutions related to entrepreneurship education perform repetitive studies that do not show an equal spread and intensity throughout the country. Based on the results of this study and the importance of entrepreneurship and the opportunities it offers, it is recommended to perform planned studies that are original in terms of purpose, scope, and content.

Keywords: Enterprise, entrepreneurship, entrepreneurship skills, entrepreneurship education, integrated skills

1. INTRODUCTION
Education is recognized as the basic instrument for students to undertake the role of well-equipped individuals and to integrate into society. In the 21st century, societies that strive to develop aim to have the means to acquire technological vocational skills for their students, which are defined as the qualifications required by the professions of the future. The literature providing experimental findings on growth emphasizes that there is a positive and strong relationship.
The concept of "Entrepreneurship", which is defined as an initial endeavor to actualize a new business idea and which was first discussed intensively in the field of business and management (Schumpeter, 1934), has started to draw interest in different disciplines and fields nowadays (Sarasvathy, 2001; Zengin & Deniz, 2016). Richard Cantillon, who conducted pioneering studies on entrepreneurship in the 1750s, described the "entrepreneur" as the person who organizes the business and undertakes the risk of the work to make a profitable business (Döm, 2008). In the current conceptualization of the term, entrepreneurship includes the activities carried out by the entrepreneur to initiate, manage and grow a business (Shane and Venkataraman, 2000; Mitchell et al., 2002; McMullen and Shepherd, 2006). Entrepreneurs aiming to create sustainable organizations in the competitive business environment, developing new business models and technologies and forming partnerships to continue their paths.

Entrepreneurship involves many competences such as planning a business, managing resources, financial strategies, and sales and marketing (Gartner, 1988). Entrepreneurs must obtain different, diverse, and integrated skills and continuously self-develop continuously. Entrepreneurs are the people who observe the constantly changing, evolving, and differentiated needs, make deductions and create new requests in this direction recognize the changes in time and provide the necessary adaptation realize the investments for the future by gathering the resources required by also considering the technological developments, do not avoid competing and taking risks, undertake responsibility and take the load (MEB, 2009). The existence of entrepreneurs brings about continuous differentiation and innovation in developed countries and forms the basis of long-term sustainable development.

In developing countries, entrepreneurs, who are considered to be the basic factor of growth and progress, can generate employment by setting up their own enterprises, as well as the potential to provide innovative goods or services and thus contribute to society. Moreover, they often explore existing needs or gaps to create opportunities for growth and achievement and provide solutions to address such needs (Gartner, 1985; Baron, 2006). Entrepreneurs usually work in business or industrial sectors, but some can also work in social or technology fields. Entrepreneurship skills that provide significant benefits for students to be prepared for social and business life and to be competitive in the business world play a crucial role in the formation of an innovation- and development-oriented community.

It is emphasized in recent high-level policy statements and international reports that in the foreseeable future, a large part of basic professional skills and qualifications will be changed and flexibility, analytic and critical thinking, solving complicated problems, and entrepreneurship skills will be more obvious and in demand. Entrepreneurial skills, which is one of the eight levels defined in the European Qualifications Framework in connection with the different levels of education, is an individual’s ability to start new businesses or new projects by utilizing characteristics such as creative thinking, risk-taking, innovation and the ability to assess business opportunities (EU, 2008). Entrepreneurial skills have been the topic of several studies and research in the relevant literature. Research on entrepreneurial skills has focused on cognitive processes, personal traits, and opportunity presentation (Shane & Venkataraman, 2000; Sarasvathy, 2001; Rauch, A., & Frese; 2007; Grégoire et al.)

In this study, in which entrepreneurship skills, which are considered as an integrated social sciences field skill, and entrepreneurship education are discussed within the scope of contemporary curriculums, the current situation analysis on the subject is made, and suggestions for improvement are presented for decision makers and practitioners based on the data obtained. According to the results of this research in which the studies on entrepreneurship education were examined through open sources; many institutions related to entrepreneurship education carry out repetitive studies that do not show an equal spread and intensity throughout the country. Based on the results of this study and the importance of entrepreneurship and the opportunities it offers, it is recommended to carry out planned studies that are original in terms of purpose, scope and content.
2. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK
Entrepreneurship skills include students’ ability to develop innovative ideas, risk taking, problem solving, teamwork, communication, leadership, and management skills. Entrepreneurship skills not only provide students with the opportunity to start their own businesses or initiatives but also equip them to be more successful in their lives and careers. These skills help students think creatively, recognize opportunities, problem-solve and adapt to change. Entrepreneurial skills play an essential role in the achievement of an entrepreneur and can be developed continuously. Entrepreneurship skills are described as the abilities, traits, and attitudes required for an entrepreneur to be successful. The skill set that supports entrepreneurship and is commonly studied in the literature and the coverage of these sets are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Skills supporting entrepreneurship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skills</th>
<th>Scope</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>Innovative thinking, creativity, and differentiation skills of entrepreneurs are emphasized. Innovation skills include being able to create new ideas, improving present ideas, and being receptive to changes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk Taking</td>
<td>Entrepreneurs’ tendency to tolerate risks and risk management skills are emphasized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business planning and management</td>
<td>Entrepreneurs’ business planning and management skills include goal setting, strategic planning, resource management, time management, project management, and operational planning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>Entrepreneurs’ leadership skills include abilities such as vision creation, motivation, team management, communication, and making decisions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing and Sales</td>
<td>Entrepreneurs’ developing marketing strategy, customer analysis, brand building, competition analysis, and sales skills are emphasized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective Communication Skills</td>
<td>Effective communication skills of entrepreneurs include verbal and written communication, presentation, negotiation, and relationship management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Management</td>
<td>Entrepreneurs' financial skills include cost analysis, cash flow management, financial planning, investment appraisal and access to sources of finance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

International comparative research shows that the Turks are an entrepreneurial society. A 2013 scientific research conducted by the National Franchising Association concluded that "While 12 out of every 100 people in the United States of America and 45 out of every 100 people in Germany want to establish their own businesses, 50 out of every 100 people in Türkiye want to establish their own businesses" (Sönmez and Toksoy, 2014). Entrepreneurship in Türkiye is more prominent, particularly among the young generation. In terms of population in the 18-24 age group, Türkiye is ranked second in Europe. One in every four entrepreneurs in Türkiye is young. However, the proportion of senior entrepreneurs aged 55-64 in Türkiye is below the European average and ranks third from the bottom among eighteen countries. Türkiye ranks first in Europe in terms of the proportion of entrepreneurs with a high school education, 14.21%. In comparison, Türkiye ranks first in Europe in terms of the proportion of entrepreneurs with pre-secondary education with 11.81% (Karadeniz, 2018).
Different explanations are provided regarding the definition, aim, and content of entrepreneurship education. In general, entrepreneurship education is the training that individuals undergo to improve their entrepreneurial skills. This type of education consists of courses in which basic knowledge and skills related to entrepreneurship are taught, related processes are explained, and experiences are shared. The curricula of entrepreneurship education focus on entrepreneurs creating new business ideas, developing a business plan to apply these ideas, improving the strategies required to market the product or service they have designed, and gaining knowledge in financial management and accounting for the resources they will need in these processes. It also aims to strengthen entrepreneurs' skills such as leadership, communication, team management, and problem solving. Entrepreneurship training generally provided by universities, business schools, entrepreneurship centers, or private training institutions. However, in countries that have recognized the significance of entrepreneurship education, it is seen that entrepreneurship-related outcomes have been embedded in curricula from primary school onwards or that stand-alone courses have been introduced at this level, and that the expectations and weight in this area have increased further in secondary education.

"Entrepreneurship Education", which is not a new concept, has been recognized since the early 1980s as an orientation that can lead to economic growth, job creation, international competitiveness and technological progress (Jack and Anderson, 1999; Audretsch et al., 2002; Ladzani and van Vuuren, 2002; Grebel et al., 2003, Vetrivel, 2010). Although considerable debate remains about the extent to which entrepreneurial competences can be taught, i.e. the "teachability" of entrepreneurship, several authors agree that entrepreneurial competences can be developed through early education (Rushing, 1990; Chell et al., 1991). On a more focused level, the Ministerial Council for Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs in Australia describes Entrepreneurship Education as "equip[ping] young people with the skills necessary to be innovative, to work individually or in teams, to identify, create and initiate business and work opportunities, and to manage them successfully" (Kirkley, 2017).

The fact that entrepreneurial competences can be developed and entrepreneurship can be learned through the education system is accepted by many sources (Gibb, 1987; Klapper, 2004; Waraich, 2012). The idea that the acquisition of entrepreneurial skills by individuals through education and the contribution to solving important issues such as economic growth, employment, poverty alleviation, and social welfare by developing entrepreneurship has caused entrepreneurship education to attract attention worldwide and in our country. This causality claim has also made the link between entrepreneurship education and entrepreneurship activities the subject of many studies (Tanrıverdi et al., 2016; Özdemir et al., 2016). The aim of entrepreneurship education, which is defined as the process of acquiring entrepreneurial skills, is to create entrepreneurial awareness in individuals and to provide them with the necessary knowledge, skills, and values to start and sustain a successful venture.

Entrepreneurship education therefore primarily aims to facilitate economic growth and increase the entrepreneurial talent pool in economies. Entrepreneurship is perceived as the main source of innovation, job creation, and growth and is considered a measure of the soundness of a country 's economy (Audretsch and Thurik, 2000). Countries that realize the importance of entrepreneurship education build their national education systems on developing students’ creativity skills and thus realize sustainable economic development (Karagöz, 2009).

Entrepreneurship and entrepreneurship education have been intensively emphasized in national top policy documents, particularly in the last decade. In the Tenth Development Plan of Türkiye, entrepreneurship is prioritized in the "Qualified Human, Strong Society" section, which is determined as the first "target and policy" area.
In the said plan, "The main objective of the education system is to raise productive and content individuals who have developed thinking, perceiving and problem solving skills, have internalised democratic values and national culture, are open to sharing and communication, have strong artistic and aesthetic senses, have self-confidence, sense of responsibility, entrepreneurship and innovation, are prone to the use and production of science and technology, are equipped with the basic knowledge and skills required by the information society and are productive and happy." is stated as "Objective 142". Furthermore, in the second objective and policy area "Innovative Production, Stable High Growth", entrepreneurship education is addressed and the policy of developing entrepreneurship culture through formal and non-formal education programs for entrepreneurship at all levels of education, increasing the quality of entrepreneurship education, introducing and rewarding entrepreneur role models is included (Ministry of Development, 2013).

In contrast to traditional education schools, an entrepreneurial education system is strongly connected with diversity among individuals with different backgrounds, interests, views, and qualifications and the ability to recognize opportunities in an uncertain environment. Contemporary curricula emphasizes entrepreneurship education and the development of entrepreneurial skills. Currently, entrepreneurship has become a part of contemporary education programs and aims to provide students with the necessary skills to be successful in business life. In that respect, it is observed that numerous studies have been conducted in Türkiye, beginning from the basic education level to the higher education level.

In curricula, various methods can be used to develop entrepreneurship skills. Among these, activities such as project-based learning, collaboration and teamwork, applied projects where students can solve real-world problems, mentoring programs, business simulations, and interaction with entrepreneur role models can be found. Entrepreneurship education, the main purpose of which is to provide individuals with motivation, knowledge, and basic skills, should be programmed in accordance with the cultural context and social realities of each society (Lee & Peterson, 2000). In fact, the program elements of entrepreneurship education vary according to countries. For instance, in the USA, entrepreneurship education is provided starting from primary school. In 2014, Denmark made arrangements for compulsory provision of entrepreneurship education in primary and vocational high schools (Reffstrup & Christiansen, 2017). In Japan, entrepreneurship education has been taught as a secondary education course since 2001. In addition, entrepreneurship education, which has become widespread and increased its importance in the following process, has started to be given in private courses (Han and Lee, 1998). Sweden, which tries to provide entrepreneurship education to students in connection with different basic education courses, provides entrepreneurship education as compulsory and elective at the secondary education level (Chiu, 2012). In the Netherlands, where schools are free to determine the curriculum, many schools provide entrepreneurship education, although it is not compulsory. Primary school students are encouraged to develop their own initiatives by performing short-term projects within the scope of programs supported by the Dutch Government. At the secondary education level, entrepreneurship is included in the outcomes of economics courses. In Finnish curricula, entrepreneurship is identified as a core competence area. Entrepreneurship education, which is considered an interdisciplinary subject in different courses taught in primary, secondary, and high schools, is compulsory in vocational high schools (Eurydice, 2016; Maya & Yılmaz, 2018). In New Zealand, curricula include vision statements stating that students are intended to become entrepreneurs. In 2007, the New Zealand Ministry of Education released a draft curriculum addressing the development of entrepreneurship skills at the secondary school level (MOE, 2007).

In Türkiye, which is recognized by the relevant circles as having great entrepreneurial potential, it is essential to acquire the necessary skills at an early age, especially through formal education, to mobilize this potential.
Taking into account the working age population, the rate of individuals with entrepreneurship education in or out of school is 21.2 % in Germany, 9.4 % in Brazil, and 6.3% in Türkiye. In addition, it is stated that the practical dimension of entrepreneurship courses given within the scope of formal education in Türkiye remains weak (SBB, 2015).

In the Ministry of National Education in Türkiye, in order to ensure that students can step into social life as "entrepreneur" students. In this direction, "Entrepreneurship" course was started to be taught compulsorily in the 2nd grade of Trade Vocational High Schools and Multi-Programme High Schools and as an elective in other vocational high schools together with "General Entrepreneurship Education Programmes" since 1995-1996 at the secondary education level. In addition, in the following process, entrepreneurship courses were included in the 3rd and 4th grade curricula of Anatolian Technical High Schools (Kahya, 2016). Since 2005, it has been seen that skills related to entrepreneurship have been attempted to be gained at the primary school level. Finally, in 2009, the elective "Entrepreneurship" course curriculum was prepared and implemented for one hour a week in one of the 10th, 11th, or 12th grades of general high schools This program which was prepared with an interdisciplinary approach, was developed within the framework of the current situation, potential, and needs of our country (MoNE, 2009). The skills acquired by students in the Elective Entrepreneurship Course are given in Table 2.

Table 2. Basic skills acquired by students in the entrepreneurship course in upper secondary education in Türkiye

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic Skills</th>
<th>Calculation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td>Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Thinking</td>
<td>Presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research-Inquiry</td>
<td>Analytical Thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem Solving</td>
<td>Decision Making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using Information Technologies</td>
<td>Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using Turkish Correctly,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectively/good use of language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the Entrepreneurship Lesson curriculum, the following topics are emphasized in relation to the vision of the entrepreneurship lesson:
- Providing students with basic information about entrepreneurship
- Gaining the necessary skills to be an entrepreneur
- Seeing job opportunities for high school student,
- tips on how to turn these opportunities into investments.

In addition, it was also mentioned that the course being one hour a week made it challenging to provide both theoretical and practical information together, and it was stated that with the implementation of this program, it was aimed to provide students with clues on how they could use their achievements in daily life and how they could transform their theoretical knowledge into tangible information (MoNE, 2009).
Table 3. Objectives of the entrepreneurship course

Objectives of the Course
- To have basic knowledge of economics,
- To comprehend the role of entrepreneurship in social and economic life,
- To understand the importance of innovation and being a researcher,
- To define basic concepts related to entrepreneurship,
- To notice the types of entrepreneurship,
- To realize how to pool resources in entrepreneurship,
- To identify the factors that encourage entrepreneurship,
- To be aware of their entrepreneurial characteristics by comparing the characteristics of entrepreneurs and their own characteristics,
- To be made aware of the business opportunities awaiting young entrepreneurs,
- Understand the process of developing a business idea and transforming it into a project
- To have information about the basic steps of the business establishment process and prepare a business plan,
- To realize the advantages and disadvantages of starting their own business,
- Gain business ethics, social, and legal responsibility awareness,
- To have knowledge about the concept, types, and functions of business
- To get to know the institutions and organizations that support entrepreneurs,
- Recognize the entrepreneurship aspects of Atatürk

The Ministry of National Education also conducts studies on entrepreneurship skills and entrepreneurship education in different areas in cooperation with various institutions and organizations. In the K12 Skills Framework Türkiye Holistic Model published because of the studies carried out in cooperation with the General Directorate of Secondary Education of the Ministry of National Education and UNICEF, "Entrepreneurship Skill" is also included in the 15 "Social Sciences Field Skills" emphasized in the K12 Skills Framework Türkiye Holistic Model (MoNE, 2023a). With the entrepreneurship targets and indicators prepared within the scope of Social Sciences Skills Türkiye Holistic Model; it is aimed to gain entrepreneurship spirit at primary and secondary school levels. In addition to the basic entrepreneurship skills acquired in primary education, commercial entrepreneurship education is prioritized in secondary education. Entrepreneurship skills in this model consist of five integrated skills. Table 4 shows the integrated skills and process components proposed for financial literacy in the K12 Skills Framework Türkiye Holistic Model.
Table 4. Integrated skills and process components recommended for the entrepreneurship skill area in the K12 Skills Framework Türkiye Integrated Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Integrated Skills</th>
<th>Components of the Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Interrogation** | - Defining the topic of interest/Tendencies: Curiosity  
- Asking questions about the related topic (5W1H)/Tendencies: Asking questions of curiosity  
- Social and Emotional Learning Skills/Tendencies: Self-motivation  
- Collecting information on the relevant topic/ Tendencies: Responsibility |
| **Prediction Based on Observations** | Relate prior observation and/or experience to the current event/topic/problem/situation. Social-Emotional Learning Skills: Flexibility Dispositions: Trust  
Making inferences about current events/issues/problems/situation trends: Analytical thinking  
Making judgments about the current event/issue/problem/situation. Higher-order thinking skills: critical thinking, decision making |
| **Decision Making by Evaluating Risks** | Identifying potential problems/uncertainties/ opportunities  
Higher -order Thinking Skills: Problem -Solving Dispositions: Creativity, skepticism  
Analyzing possible problems, uncertainties, and opportunities. Higher-order thinking skills: problem solving  
Grading risks and making suggestions on measures to be taken  
Higher -order Thinking Skills: Problem solving, decision making  
Social-Emotional Learning Skills: Self-confidence, determination |
| **Managing Resources** | Making reasoned judgments  
Higher Order Thinking Skills: Decision making, critical thinking  
Social-Emotional Learning Skills: Responsible decision-making  
Dispositions: Independence  
Review Trends: Specialization, concentration, and analytical thinking |
| **Finalizing the Idea** | Tendencies to identify resources: initiative, commitment, analytical thinking, and self-confidence  
Tendencies to acquire and effectively utilize resources: initiative, responsibility, self-confidence, perseverance, and determination |
| | Product creation trends: creativity, specialization, focus, and systematics  
Trends in product promotion: creativity  
Evaluating the consequences of the idea  
Higher Order Thinking Skills: Critical thinking, making decisions |

Considering Türkiye ‘s historical and cultural background, its current socio-economic situation, its young and dynamic population, its potential that is open and ready for development, and its social needs, it is clear that entrepreneurship education is.
Acting on this reality, various institutions, organizations, and foundations in Türkiye are exerting intense efforts in the field of entrepreneurship skills and entrepreneurship education. This study is a result of the increasing interest in entrepreneurship skills and education. In this study, "Entrepreneurship Skills" and "Entrepreneurship Education", which are considered as integrated social sciences field skills within the scope of contemporary curricula, are discussed, the current situation analysis on the subject is made, and policy recommendations for development are presented for decision-makers and practitioners based on the data obtained.

3. METHOD AND MODEL
In this study, a literature review was conducted to reveal the current situation in Türkiye regarding entrepreneurship. In this study, which was conducted through open sources, methods and techniques such as qualitative research, document and content analysis were used, so ethics committee approval was not required. Throughout the preparatory processes of the research, academic ethical principles were followed.

In this study, which is a general survey model, the current situation and practices in entrepreneurship education in Türkiye are reviewed and described. First, the institutions and organizations providing entrepreneurship education in Türkiye were identified. In the first stage of the study, it was determined that the Ministry of National Education, Universities, Ministry of Labor and Social Security, Ministry of Family and Social Services, Ministry of Industry and Technology, local governments and local administrations, non-governmental organizations, professional associations and cooperatives, Ministry of Youth and Sports, Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, Ministry of Trade, Ministry of Justice, and other institutions, foundations and organizations provide "Entrepreneurship Education". In the second stage of the study, entrepreneurship trainings conducted by these institutions and organizations in 81 provinces were examined through open sources.

In the research, a survey study was conducted and the content the analysis method was used. Content analysis is defined as a systematic, repeatable technique in which some words of a content are summarized with smaller content categories by coding based on certain rules (Büyüköztürk et al. 2008). The qualitative research design was preferred for reasons such as being suitable for the purpose, scope, and model of this research. Qualitative research is a research model in which qualitative data collection methods such as document and content analysis are used and a qualitative process is followed to reveal perceptions, events, and situations in a realistic and holistic manner in a natural environment (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013).

1.1. Data Collection Methods and Procedures
All data used in this study were obtained from open sources. First all relevant institutions, foundations, and organizations that perform training activities related to entrepreneurship were scanned. Within the scope of the scan, official web pages, announcements, notices, announcements, notifications,, and news of relevant institutions, foundations, and organizations were scanned. After identifying the Ministries and affiliated institutions, universities, municipalities, governorships, district governorships, non-governmental organizations, and civil initiatives operating in this field, a second scan was conducted in 81 provinces.

1.2. Data Analysis
In the first stage of this research, it was ensured that all the data obtained during the screening process were activities that included entrepreneurship education. Activities without direct entrepreneurship training were excluded from the data. After the second screening of 81 provinces, frequency analyzes and interpretations were made on the data obtained.
1.3. Validity and reliability
In qualitative research, validity means that the researcher observes the phenomenon as it is and as impartially as possible and conveys the results of the observation. The validity of the research increases when the measurement tool accurately measures the phenomenon it measures in studies where qualitative research methods are preferred. In a research process that pays attention to the validity criteria, the data collected reflect the real situation as accurately as possible and contribute to the validity of the research results (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). To ensure validity in this study, expert review and expert interview methods were used. Researchers with recognized expertise in qualitative research methods and who had previously conducted studies on the research topic were asked to examine this research in different dimensions to increase the validity of the study (Creswell, 2003).

The data obtained in this study and the research process were examined by two expert researchers. Reliability in research is defined as the ability to repeat the measurement under different conditions and to reach the same results under different conditions. To ensure reliability, which is explained as the ability to reach the same research results by different researchers using the same methods, different methods and techniques are used (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). In this study, in which document and content analyzes were used, coding performed by different researchers to ensure reliability.

4. FINDINGS
Because of the document and content analyzes carried out within the scope of the study, it was seen that entrepreneurship education in Türkiye is conducted in formal and informal ways in the organizational context. Figure 1 shows the systematic structure applied in entrepreneurship education in Türkiye.
According to Figure 1, entrepreneurship education was organized by different institutions and organizations either formally or outside school-based learning systems. Most of the activities conducted within the scope of formal education are carried out by the Ministry of National Education, while the Ministry of Labor and Social Security and the Ministry of Industry and Technology also organize trainings in this context due to the context of "Entrepreneurship". Within the scope of the research, institutions, foundations, and organizations that provide entrepreneurship education in Türkiye were also scanned. The findings are shown in Figure 2.
Figure 2. Institutions, foundations, and organizations providing entrepreneurship education in Türkiye

Figure 2 shows that entrepreneurship training mainly delivered by the public sector. In addition, professional associations and cooperatives and non-governmental organizations with public support are also active in this field. This study examines the approaches adopted in activities focused on "Entrepreneurship Education" in Türkiye, their levels, and scope. Table 5 shows the activities focusing on entrepreneurship skills in Turkish curricula and the levels of these activities.
Table 5. Fields, Levels, and Scopes of Studies Focusing on Entrepreneurship Skills in Türkiye

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approach of the study</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Scope</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Secondary Education</td>
<td>Theoretical and practical information on entrepreneurship is provided to the students. This training helps students comprehend entrepreneurship processes, develop business ideas, and acquire business planning and management skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courses</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
<td>The required skills for a student at the secondary level to be able to see business opportunities and turn these opportunities into investments are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship Trainings</td>
<td>Secondary Education</td>
<td>Universities and secondary schools host entrepreneurship teams and organizations. These teams provide students with entrepreneurship-related resources, mentoring programs, processes for developing business ideas, and networking opportunities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities of Entrepreneurship Clubs and Organizations</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
<td>Many institutions and organizations conduct business plan competitions for students. In these competitions, students develop their own business ideas, create their business plans, and present them to a panel of judges. Business plan competitions offer students the opportunity to experience the entrepreneurial process and evaluate business ideas in the real world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship Competitions</td>
<td>Adult</td>
<td>Internship and mentoring programs can be offered to students to develop their entrepreneurial skills. These programs allow students to gain experience in actual business environments and shape their own entrepreneurial journey with guidance from experienced entrepreneurs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship and Mentoring Programs Activities of the Innovation and Entrepreneurship Centers</td>
<td>Secondary Education</td>
<td>Universities and research institutions support students and researchers by establishing innovation and entrepreneurship centers. They offer resources such as entrepreneurship training, development of business ideas, prototyping opportunities, and business consultancy. In the centers, students have the opportunity to bring their ideas to life and gain access to the entrepreneurial ecosystem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities of Associations and Foundations that Conduct Efforts Related to Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
<td>With the programs they design and implement, non-profit non-governmental organizations aim to ensure that children and young persons are trained as individuals with an entrepreneurial mindset, prepare them for business life, and help them gain a global perspective.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the information given in the table above, entrepreneurship trainings are taught as stand-alone courses at secondary and higher education levels or as a subject or outcome in a curriculum. Entrepreneurship training is organized for adults within the scope of secondary education, higher education, or lifelong learning.
In addition, the objective; "...to regulate the procedures and principles of social activities within the scope of student clubs and community service in scientific, social, cultural, moral, ethical, humanitarian, and cultural values in all types and levels of public and private formal and lifelong learning institutions; to develop self-confidence and sense of responsibility in students and trainees, to create new areas of interest, to gain national, spiritual, moral, humanitarian, and cultural values in addition to curricula; and social activities to be held in educational institutions by public institutions and organizations, international organizations, and non-governmental organizations. ..." The Regulation on Social Activities in Educational Institutions of the Ministry of National Education includes "Entrepreneurship Club" among the student clubs to be established in schools and "Entrepreneurship Week (first week of March)" in the schedule of specific days and weeks. The common approaches seen in Table 5 are the common methods used to develop entrepreneurship skills within curricula. An education landscape in which entrepreneurial skills are encouraged and supported contributes to the development of future entrepreneurs and increases the potential for innovation and job creation. The activities of the Ministry of National Education, Universities, Ministry of Labour and Social Security, Ministry of Family and Social Services, Ministry of Industry and Technology, local governments and local administrations, non-governmental organizations, professional associations and cooperatives, Ministry of Youth and Sports, Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, Ministry of Trade, Ministry of Justice, and other institutions, organizations, and institutions in the field of "Entrepreneurship Education" in 81 provinces were reviewed. The data obtained because of the review are shown in Table 6.

**Table 6.** The distribution of Entrepreneurship Training Activities conducted by Institutions, foundations, and Institutions in Türkiye by Total Number of Provinces

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Number of provinces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ministry of Industry and Technology</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ministry of Labor and Social Security</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Other Institutions and Organizations</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Universities</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ministry of Youth and Sports</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Professional Associations and Cooperatives</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Civil Society Organizations</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Local Governments and Local Administrations</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Ministry of National Education</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Ministry of Family and Social Services</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Ministry of Justice</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Ministry of Trade</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Table 6, the Ministry of Industry and Technology and the Ministry of Labor and Social Security are active in entrepreneurship training in all 81 provinces. The Ministry of Family and Social Services (13 provinces), the Ministry of Justice (11 provinces), and the Ministry of Trade (16 provinces) were the last three institutions and organizations screened. Figure 3 shows the province-based activity intensity of the screened institutions.
Figure 3. The province-based activity intensity of the screened institutions

*Türkiye is divided into 7 geographical regions and 81 provinces.

The provinces in which institutions and organizations carrying out various activities in the field of entrepreneurship education in Türkiye operated were examined, and a province-based score was generated. No province has a province where all the organizations subject to the scan are active. Table 7, sample studies, initiatives, and units established by institutions, organizations, and initiatives operating in the field of entrepreneurship education in Türkiye.
Table 7. Activities carried out by institutions, organizations, and entrepreneurs in the field of entrepreneurship education in Türkiye.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutions/Organizations</th>
<th>Example Activity/Initiative/Department</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Universities               | - Entrepreneurship and business development application and research centers  
|                            | - Entrepreneurship and brand management courses for incorporation and entrepreneurship units  
|                            | - Entrepreneurship and business administration applications and research centers  
|                            | - Technology transfer office applications and research centers  
|                            | - Young entrepreneur application and research center  
|                            | - Career and entrepreneurship clubs  
|                            | - Entrepreneurship and university-industry cooperation application and research centers  
|                            | Practical entrepreneurship training in agriculture faculties |
| Local Authorities          | - City council entrepreneurship trainings  
|                            | - Cooperative development and orientation training  
|                            | - Programs for women  
|                            | - Programs for young people  
|                            | - Vocational courses  
|                            | - Activity centers  
|                            | - Science centers  
|                            | - Science and art centers  
|                            | - Women ‘s workforce development centers  
|                            | - Youth and innovation training  
|                            | - Entrepreneurship and leadership training  
|                            | - Directorates of agricultural development and Entrepreneurship  
| Private/Individual Enterprises | - Entrepreneurship Centers  
|                                | - Entrepreneurship Networks  
| Professional Chambers        | - Young entrepreneur boards  
|                                | - Women entrepreneurs boards  
|                                | - Young entrepreneur academies  
| Directorates of National Education | Entrepreneurship and vocational training workshops  
|                                 | - Science and art centers  
|                                 | - Rural life centers  
|                                 | - Teacher academies  
| Projects/Programs             | - Capacity Building of Institutions in the Entrepreneurship Ecosystem Grant Program  
|                                | - Supporting women ‘s employment operation grant program  
|                                | - Promotion of the youth employment technical assistance project  
|                                | - Strengthening women ‘s entrepreneurship in the agriculture program  
|                                | - Young women build their future projects  
|                                | - GençBizz high school entrepreneurship program |
### Foundations, Associations, and NGOs - Business development centers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Training Centers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Directorates of Youth and Sports</td>
<td>- Training and counseling centers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Justice, General Directorate of Prisons and Detention</td>
<td>- Local entrepreneurship associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry</td>
<td>- Entrepreneurship and education associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Trade</td>
<td>- Youth centers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Industry and Technology, KOSGEB, TUBITAK</td>
<td>- Entrepreneurship training for young people</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Cooperation between Different Institutions and Organizations - Türkiye Women Entrepreneurs Academy, Technology development and training centers, Techno-entrepreneurship and innovation center

According to Table 7, training activities are conducted by different institutions, organizations, foundations, organizations, and individuals in different names, themes, contexts, and fields, with entrepreneurship as the main axis. In terms of diversity, universities stand out. It is also noteworthy that joint thematic activities are conducted for different social segments such as youth, women, and convicts.

Within the scope of this study, the status of entrepreneurship education at the provincial level was also analyzed. Because of the analysis, the provinces were categorized into 5 groups. Table 8 presents the scores of provinces in the field of entrepreneurship education and the groups formed in line with these scores. In addition, entrepreneurship trainings organised by local governments for different audiences are also significant. Some examples of these can be given as follows:

- Programmes for women,
- Programmes for young people,
- Women's labour force development centres
- Youth and innovation training
- Entrepreneurship and leadership training
According to Table 8, the most intensive activity in the field of entrepreneurship training is carried out in Kocaeli province (90 points). Ankara, Bursa, Eskişehir, stanbul, and Konya followed Kocaeli with 80 points. It is noteworthy that zmir is in the third group and Diyarbakır ranks last in the list with 30 points. On the other hand, relatively small provinces such as Ardahan, Artvin, Bayburt, Bilecik, Bingöl, Gümüşhane, Kars, and rnak are also in Group 1.

Based on the general results of the study, the following findings were made regarding entrepreneurship education:
- There is no integrated and independent education policy in the context of entrepreneurship. In the existing top policy documents on entrepreneurship, there is not enough reference to the education context.
- Although there is not a top policy document directly related to entrepreneurship education, in recent years, policy development efforts have been intensively carried out in close and related areas, as in the examples of "Türkiye Entrepreneurship Strategy and Action Plan", "Entrepreneurship Action Plan" and "National Technology Entrepreneurship Strategy Action Plan".
- Traditional socioeconomic status shows resistance to entrepreneurship and thus to entrepreneurship education.
- Entrepreneurship training activities are concentrated in specific provinces.
- Various institutions, foundations, and organizations perform duplicate activities in most cases without the necessary cooperation and coordination.
- Regional and province-based inventory studies on Entrepreneurship Education are not comprehensive or comprehensive enough.
- Except for good examples of successful practices such as the Ministry of Labour and Social Security, Ministry of Industry and Technology, and Ministry of Youth and Sports, the organizational and traditional institutional structures of other institutions and organizations do not support the realization of the existing potential in the field of entrepreneurship education at the desired level.
- Public institutions and organizations are at the forefront of entrepreneurship education rather than the private sector and initiatives.
- Entrepreneurship education, which is predominantly conducted by public institutions and organizations, naturally occurs with a "centralist" approach in terms of curriculum, methods and techniques adopted, and content.
- Entrepreneurship training is not monitored by a collective and effective monitoring and evaluation mechanism at the national level.
- The resources, opportunities, and capabilities of the private sector are not sufficiently utilized in this field.
- Institutional and societal awareness of the potential positive impact of entrepreneurship education on socioeconomic development is insufficient.
- In a country with low socioeconomic, cultural, and political homogeneity, there is no standard dress that fits all segments and no single solution that can be applied to every case. This situation is ignored in entrepreneurship education, and a standard approach is adopted.
- Entrepreneurship education is a field that is informed by different disciplines because of its structure, but the requirements of this situation are not fulfilled in the studies carried out.
- Türkiye’s integration with the international community, young and dynamic population, and historical and cultural depth offer great opportunities for entrepreneurship education.

5. DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION and RECOMMENDATIONS
Underpinning the work in entrepreneurship education and other related fields is that an "entrepreneurial" attitude and approach to education leads to greater social cohesion, learning, and economic growth. How a country builds its education system directly contributes to people developing the qualities that are considered important for entrepreneurship.

Based on the results obtained from the study, entrepreneurship trainings are generally conducted through collaborations and protocols between different institutions and organizations. The institutions with the most protocols in this field are KOSGEB and İŞKUR. Particularly in large and industrially developed cities, İŞKUR seems to be active with "vocational training" courses. Entrepreneurship training is also provided in public education centers through non-formal education.

An example of good practices can be provided by the Ministry of Justice in Burdur to increase the rehabilitation and social cohesion of ex-convicts by providing entrepreneurship training in cooperation with KOSGEB and establishing their own businesses with grant support (Ministry of Justice, 2020).
In prominent provinces in agriculture and animal husbandry, the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry primarily organizes training for young entrepreneur candidates and provides grant support. It has been observed that professional solidarity organizations established under different names such as "women, young entrepreneurs, investors, entrepreneurs, industrialists, business people" also reach out to social groups, especially their members, and provide entrepreneurship training.

**Policy Recommendations:**
- Policy development efforts focusing directly on entrepreneurship education should be prioritized.
- Entrepreneurship education should be given more space in top policy documents directly or indirectly related to entrepreneurship education, and responsible/cooperative units should be clearly stated. High-level policy documents on entrepreneurship should be developed with a more participatory approach and in direct communication with practitioners and the field.
- When preparing curricula on entrepreneurship, contexts such as sales, marketing, cooperatives, and commercialization should be considered instead of an abstract design such as "Entrepreneurship Education".
- Entrepreneurship education should develop solutions and interventions specific to the individual, society, and country.
- New information and methods needed in entrepreneurship education, which overlaps with different disciplines, feeds on them, and requires joint work, should be added to this field by considering social norms and values.
- It is observed that these studies conducted in the field of entrepreneurship are mostly educational activities. Education and its various institutions are central to the establishment and ongoing development of entrepreneurial communities.
- It has demonstrated that quality teaching practices (and thus highly skilled teachers) are an integral part of an entrepreneurial community.
- While planning entrepreneurship education, which should not be handled independently from social culture and realities, it is extremely important to consider issues such as education, related learning, skills, orientation and encouragement of students, social needs, socio-economic situation, sustainability, etc. for the success of the process.
- Building an entrepreneurial community or an entrepreneurial school cannot be achieved through entrepreneurship education alone. The formula for successful cultural adaptation to "entrepreneurship" lies in participation, inclusion, sharing, and support among all community stakeholder groups.
- Ideal entrepreneurship education programs should offer a comprehensive perspective, combining the theoretical aspect of entrepreneurship and its practical applications.
- Entrepreneurship should be treated as a soft skill
- Provide entrepreneurship training in a practical working environment and in the field instead of only theoretically and in a classroom environment. Entrepreneurship education programs that include more practice should be organized.
- Successful entrepreneurs sharing their experiences and addressing real-world scenarios through case studies are also common learning methods.
- In educational institutions, systematic efforts should be made to give children an entrepreneurial spirit, especially from the primary and preschool years. For students in this period, rather than commercial entrepreneurship, the emphasis should be on self-expression, seeing opportunities, gathering resources, developing and implementing projects, making innovations or innovations in their school, and organizing various organizations. In secondary education, students should receive a business entrepreneurship education that builds on this foundation. Entrepreneurship courses in secondary education institutions should be based on commercial entrepreneurship.
Because for students who cannot pass from secondary education to higher education, their education life is largely completed. After this phase, individuals who employ others should be trained instead of individuals who only expect to be employed.

- Considering the current socioeconomic situation in Türkiye, unemployment continues to be an important problem. Students attending higher education institutions and university graduate unemployment rates also increase the severity of this problem. Accordingly, introducing students to entrepreneurship at the secondary education level so that they do not see higher education and civil service as the only successful path will contribute to the solution of the problem. It is really challenging for a young person graduating from a secondary school to find a job, and for this reason, they should graduate from high school by acquiring different skills.

REFERENCES


